

# BRITISH VIEW

MULTIDISCIPLINARY JOURNAL



[www.britishview.co.uk](http://www.britishview.co.uk)

Anthropologie, Applied Linguistics, Applied Physics, Architecture, Artificial Intelligence, Astronomy, Biological Sciences, Botany, Chemistry, Communication studies, Computer Sciences, Computing technology, Cultural studies, Design, Earth Sciences, Ecology, Education, Electronics, Energy, Engineering Sciences, Environmental Sciences, Ethics, Ethnicity and Racism Studies, Fisheries, Forestry, Gender Studies, Geography, Health Sciences, History, Interdisciplinary Social Sciences, Labour studies, Languages and Linguistics, Law, Library Studies, Life sciences, Literature, Logic, Marine Sciences, Materials Engineering, Mathematics, Media Studies, Medical Sciences, Museum Studies, Music, Nanotechnology, Nuclear Physics, Optics, Philosophy, Physics, Political Science, Psychology, Publishing and editing, Religious Studies, Social Work, Sociology, Space Sciences, Statistics, Transportation, Visual and Performing Arts, Zoology and all other subject areas.

### **Editorial board**

**Dr. Marcella Mori** Agrochemical Research Centre, Sciensano, Brussels, Belgium.

**Dr. Sara Villari** Istituto Zooprofilattico Sperimentale della Sicilia, Palermo, Italy.

**Dr. Loukia V. Ekateriniadou** Hellenic Agricultural Organization, Thessaloniki, Greece.

**Dr. Makhkamova Feruza** Tashkent Pediatric Medical Institute Uzbekistan

**Prof. Dr. Xhelil Koleci** Agricultural University of Tirana, Albania.

**Prof Dr. Dirk Werling** The Royal Veterinary College, London, UK.

**Dr. Otabek Yusupov** Samarkand State Institute of Foreign Languages

**Dr. Alimova Durдона** Tashkent Pediatric Medical Institute

**Dr. Jamol D. Ergashev** Tashkent Pediatric Medical Institute

**Dr. Avezov Muhiddin Ikromovich** Urgench branch of Tashkent Medical Academy

**Dr. Jumaniyozov Khurmatbek Palvannazirovich** Urgench state university

**Dr. Karimova Aziza** Samarkand Institute of Economics and Service

**Dr. Rikhsikhodjaeva Gulchekhra** Tashkent State Transport University

**Dr. David Blane** General Practice & Primary Care, University of Glasgow, UK

**Dr Raquel Gómez Bravo** Research Group Self-Regulation and Health, Institute for Health and Behaviour, Department of Behavioural and Cognitive Sciences, Faculty of Humanities, Education, and Social Sciences, University of Luxembourg, Luxembourg

**Dr. Euan Lawson** Faculty of Health and Medicine, University of Lancaster, UK

**Dr. Krsna Mahbubani** General practice, Brondesbury Medical Centre/ University College London, UK

**Dr. Patrick Redmond** School of Population Health & Environmental Science, King's College London, UK

**Dr. Lecturer Liz Sturgiss** Department of General Practice, Monash University, Australia

**Dr Sathish Thirunavukkarasu** Department of Global Health, Population Health Research Institute, McMaster University, Canada

**Dr. Sarah White** Department of Biomedical Sciences, Macquarie University, New Zealand

**Dr. Michael Gordon Whitfield** NIHR Health Protection Research Unit in Healthcare-Associated Infections and Antimicrobial Resistance, Imperial College London, UK

**Dr. Tursunov Khatam** Andijan State Medical Institute Uzbekistan

Manuscripts typed on our article template can be submitted through our website here. Alternatively, authors can send papers as an email attachment to [editor@britishview.co.uk](mailto:editor@britishview.co.uk)

Editor Multidisciplinary Journals

Website: <http://britishview.co.uk>

Email: [editor@britishview.co.uk](mailto:editor@britishview.co.uk)

## TYOLOGY OF THE RIDDLE ABOUT THE BUTTERFLY IN "CODEX CUMANICUS"

Kulieva Dilshoda Alijon qizi,  
PhD student of Namangan State University  
[kulievadilshoda98@gmail.com](mailto:kulievadilshoda98@gmail.com)

**Abstract:** This article discusses the riddle about the butterfly in “Codex Cumanicus” manuscript belongs to XIV century and kept in library of Marchana in Italy nowadays. Though this riddle has a solution as mentioned above “butterfly” its answer is different in modern parallel Turkic riddles. In order to identify this the riddle type was compared to modern Turkic parallel riddles of Uzbek, Karakalpak, Kazak, Kyrgyz, Turkmen, Turk, Tatar, Azerbaijan and others. In addition to this, the translations of it made by Bang, Nemet, Malov, Tietse, Drimba, Garkaves, Guner, Jafarov were compared to each other. The result showed that this riddle must have a different answer “Mirror” as given in modern Turkic parallels.

**Keywords:** Codec Cumanicus; first riddle; butterfly; mirror; manuscript; Introduction.

Riddles are one of the eternal genres of folklore, which motivates people to be quickwitted and smart. Although there is no exact information about when the first riddles appeared in Central Asia, the first written sources in these areas can be found in the 19th century. (Tietse ,1966) However, we can also find riddles in the cuman language in the thematic dictionary Codex Cumanikus which was written in Latin script and created at the end of the 13th and the beginning of the 14th century. (Kulieva, 2022) This manuscript is kept in Marchana National library of Italy nowadays. All 47 riddles are situated on pages 60a and 60b of the Codex Cumanicus manuscript. Some do not have solutions, due to the erosion of the edges of the pages, and some parts and the answers to several riddles have become impossible to read. (Kulieva, 2022) The butterfly riddle is the first one in the manuscript and stated at the first and second lines. Though its solution is given as a butterfly, this riddle’s modern versions offer a different solution. This article discusses this problem as it was not learnt yet. Some words are not so clear, so many linguists offered their own translations and versions for this riddle. For example, one of the translators of the riddles who inverted it into Dutch is Bang with his article named “Über die Rätsel des Codex Cumanicus”. (Bang, 1912). The other is Nemeth with his article named “Die Rätsel des Codex Cumanicus” (Nemeth, 1913). They gave their transliterations and interpretations of the riddle. In addition to this, Malov with his “К истории и критике Codex Cumanicus” (Malov, 1930) and Garkaves in his book named “Codex Cumanicus: Половецкие молитвы, гимны и загадки XIII-XIV веков” (Garkaves, 2006) translated all riddles into Russian. Tietse translated it into English in his book named “The Koman Riddles and Turkic Folklore” (Tietse, 1966) and he also gave some subtypes of the riddle from the modern Turkic nations literature. Tietse offered the riddle a new solution as he considers its answer not suitable. Drimba translated

the riddle into French in his book called “Syntaxe comane” (Drimba, 1973). Jafarov in his dissertation (Jafarov, 2017) translated the riddles into Uzbek and he was the first Uzbek translator.

As mentioned above, origin of the modern Turkic riddles relates to the comane riddles. As a result, many riddles in the manuscript have forms in modern Turkic riddles. For example, the first riddle has exactly or some words changed form is present in Uzbek (Husainova, 1981), Kyrgyz (Ibraimov, 2002), Turkmen (Seyidow, 2005), Karakalpak (Maqsetov, 1978), Turkish (Elçin, 1989), Kazak (Amanjolov, 2003), riddle collections.

Above all translators only Tietse offered a new solution, but other translators agreed with the solution butterfly.

By comparing all modern riddles, it is decided that the comane riddle must have a different solution. Maybe, the writer of the manuscript mistakenly wrote a different answer or maybe time passing changed the riddle’s answer.

#### Materials and Methods

Comparative typology and comparing-historical methods were used in this article. All above modern Turkic nations riddles were used and they were compared into Comane riddle. The translations were also compared into each other in order to identify whether the riddle saves its meaning or not. Because Dutch, English or Russian are not close language to the comane language. Parallel forms of the riddle type were compared by Tietse earlier, but he did not compare the modern Turkic riddles which we did. As we consider Uzbek, Kazak and Kyrgyz are the closest to the Comane language. So the subtypes in these folks literature are the most correct and clear versions of it.

#### Results:

The riddles of the Turkic peoples which have some elements of the Comane riddle or are exactly similar were studied. It is important to note that the answers to the riddles of the modern nations are different. In many cases, they have the answer "Mirror". But we should pay attention to the fact that the answer to Comane riddle is a *butterfly*. We believe that it is appropriate to offer the answer to this riddle: “*Mirror*”. This device is not satisfactory in terms of form and does not solve the problem of meaning. It is impossible to know what the *mirror (butterfly)* is referring to in the lines. According to Tietza(Tietse, 1966) the correct answer for this riddle is mirror. The Turkish riddles about the butterfly do not have any similarity or closeness with the Comane riddle. So, as all mirror riddles are nearly the same with the comane riddle type, we accept that it must have the answer Mirror.

#### Discussion.

First of all, the riddle in the manuscript must be analysed. As it is told, it was translated by Bang and Nemeth, also Radloff into Dutch.

Bang (1912, p 336) offers the following transliteration and translation:

Tap tap tamyzik

Tamadirgan tamizik

Kolagasi b\_\_\_\_

Kojedirgan tamyzik

OI kobelek.

Knister-knaster Feuerbrand,  
Ein Feuerbrand {ist's}, der tropfen kann,  
Schatten [wirft er ??];  
Ein Feuerbrand [ist's], den man auflegen kann.

Auflösung: der gelbe Farbstoff.

Nemeth (1913, pp. 578 ) offers the followings:

Tap, tap tamizik.

Tamaidrgan tamizik;

Kolagasi [bar]

Kojedirgan tamizik.

OI kobelek.

**Erfasse nur, es ist eine Flamme,  
Eine Flamme, die man erfassen kann,  
Sie hat Schatten,  
Ein Flamme, die man loslassen kann.**

**Auflösung: der Schmetterling.**

Radloff (1915; taken from Malov, 1930, p.350) refuses Bang and Nemeth translations and offers a new version:

**Finde es! Finde es, es ist ein Tropfen,  
Ein tropfelnder (d.h. in der Luft schwebender) Tropfen;  
Sein Schatten [am Boden]  
Ist ein losgelassener (wagrecht sich fortbewegender) Tropfen.**

**Der Schmetterling.**

Bang and Nemeth connects the first and second lines with fire, however Radloff corrects it and changes it into drop. We can conclude that Radloff's version is the correct and suits to the original one.

Malov's Russian translation (Malov, 1930) is following:

**Найди! Найди! Это – капля  
Каплющая капля.  
Когда раздуется костер,  
То это – горящая головня. Это – бабочка.**

*Find! Find! This is a drop*

*Drop drop.*

*When the fire blows up*

*That is a burning wood. This is a butterfly.*

Garkaves (Garkaves, 2006) also translated this riddle into Russian:

**Tap-tap – tamiziq,  
tama diryan tamiziq,  
kolagasi bar**

**küye dıryan tamiziq.  
Ol, köbelek.**

**Угадай, угадай / Кап-кап – уголёк,  
каплей каплет уголёк,  
тень бросая за собой,  
горит-сгорает уголёк.**

**Это ночной мотылёк, бабочка.**

*Guess, guess / Cap-cap - coal,  
drop droplet coal,  
throwing a shadow behind you  
coal is burning.*

*This is a night moth, a butterfly.*

Comparing Malov and Garkaves translations it was identified that the first one translated according to the meaning. Actually, the riddle says that *it has a shadow made from silver*. But Malov says that when the fire blows up, so from one side he is right as this line may give such kind of meaning. The latter one is comparing not wood, but coal burning. So from the riddle it can be concluded that Malov's translation is more understandable than that of Garkaves. In addition to this, Garkaves says that the answer is not only a butterfly, but a type of it which flies around the lamp at night. His version, on the other hand can be correct as this type of butterflies fly very close to lamp and it may be hurt on the heat of the lamp.

Drimba(Drimba, 1973) translated it into French:

**Devine, devine: c'est une goutte,  
Une goutte qui goutte;  
[lorsqu']il] donne de l'ombre,  
C'est un copeau qui brule. C'est le papillon.**

*Guess, guess: it's a drop,  
A drop that drips;  
[when] it gives shade,  
It's a flea that burns. It's the butterfly.*

His translation gives exact meaning of the riddle.

Tietse (Tietse, 1966) translated the riddle into English and also compared so many parallel modern forms. His translation is the following:

Find it, find the riddle,  
The blazing riddle.  
Its shadow is of silver,  
The burning riddle.

Tietse offers the third line the word “is of silver- kumusdan” (Tietse, 1966). He says that he added this word because of the other modern types. He may be right as this part is not clear in the manuscript. He also offers the “*Mirror*” answer, as no one offered before.

Guner who translated the riddle into Turkish gave the following version:

**Tap, tap, tamızık,  
Tama durgan tamızık,  
Kölegesi ba[r]  
Köye durgan tamızık.  
Ol köbelek.**

*Bul, bul, damlacık,  
Damlayıveren damlacık,  
Gölgesi var  
Yanıveren damlacık.*

**O, kelebek.**

Find, find, droplet,  
dripping droplet,  
has a shadow  
Burning droplet.

**It's the butterfly.**

Jafarov (Jafarov, 2017) translated it into Uzbek:

*tap tap tamızık,  
tamadiringan tamızık  
kolagasi b...  
kojediringan tamızık. (ol – kobelek)*

Табдили:

**топ-топ томизик,  
томадирган томизик  
қўланкаси б(ор),  
куядирган томизик (бу – парвонадир).**

*Find, find, drip,  
drop by drop  
Which has a shadow  
burning drop (this is a propeller).*

Comparing all translations, we can identify that the Radloff's Dutch version, Malov's Russian version, and other all translations were suitable to the original one.

Modern Turkish Riddles must also be compared, in order to have a clear cut answer.

Turkmen (Gurbanov, 1960) riddle which is about mirror is similar to the form the Comane riddle.

**Dam-damğam,  
Damdiran damğam.  
Gülbahar içinde  
Güldüren damğam.  
Ajna.**

*My drop, my drop,  
My dripping drop.*

*Amidst the bloom of spring  
My drop which causes happy laughter  
Mirror.*

Kazak version (Amanjalov, 2003)

Taban-taban taban-ay,  
Tabani zalpaq qojan-ay  
Kolenkesi komisten.  
Kulip turyan qojan-ay.  
Ajna.

*Sole to sole, sole like.  
Flat-soled rabbit like,  
Its shadow is of silver,  
Like a constantly laughing rabbit. Mirror.*

Another Kazak version (Amanjalov, 2003, pp86) and one Karakalpak riddle (Maqsetov, 1978, 54) which were about mirror have similar third line with the comane one, but other lines are not the same.

The following Uzbek riddle not considering the third line has the same elements of the Comane riddle. (Husainova, 1981)

**Tom, tom, tomchi,  
Tomib turgan tomchi,  
Ayni sahar ichida,  
Kulib turgan tomchi.  
(Oyna)  
Drip, drip, the drop  
Dripping drop,  
Early in the dawn,  
Laughing drop. Mirror.**

Also the following Kyrgyz riddle (Ibraimov, 2002) has the same parts to the comane one.

Tam-tam tamenek,  
Tamdan chikkan koyanak,  
Kulu shaar ichinde,  
Kulup turgan koyanak. Kuzgu.

Some parts of this riddle cannot be translated as most words are just used to form the riddle rhythm, but overall meaning is still the same with the comane one. There is a big question whether the word *tap-tap* in the comane riddle refers to drip or its noise in the comane language this word may give such meaning is not clear. But many scientists as it was mentioned above considered it as drip.

**Conclusion:**



In conclusion, it is clear the translations of the riddle made by turkic linguists are suitable, but the answer is not accepted by all of the translators. Tietse offered a new solution as MIRROR, so following him some research has been done. The result is that His solution must be accepted, as some other versions of this riddle type have been found in modern Turkic riddles. The comane riddle has the words e.g. tamiziq-drip, tamaduryan-dripping, kolenke- shadow, kulup-laughing, kuyadirgan- burning. Many Turkic riddles have these words too. The answer Mirror must be chosen as a solution to this riddle type.

#### REFERENCES

1. Bang, W. (1912). Über die Rätsel des Codex Cumanicus. *Sitzungsberichte Preus. Akademiya*, 334-353.
2. Drimba, V. (1973). *Syntaxe Comane*. Leiden: Bucuresti.
3. Guner , G. (2020). Kuman bilmecelelerinin söz varlığı ve dil hususiyetleri üzerine bir inceleme. *Uluslararası türk lehçe araştırmaları dergisi (türklad)*, 4. cilt, 1. sayı, 16-41.
4. Nemeth, J. (1913). Die Rätsel des Codex Cumanicus. *Ztschr. Deutsch.. – Morgenland Gesel*, 577-608.
5. Tietse, A. (1966). *The Koman Riddles and Turkic Folklore*. Berkeley: Oxford press
6. Гаркавец, А. (2006). *Codex Cumanicus: Половецкие молитвы, гимны и загадки XIII-XIV веков*. Москва: Русский деревня.
7. Жафаров, Б. (2017). Кодекс Куманикус”–туркий халқлар ёзма обидаси: Филология фанлари бўйича фалсафа доктори (PhD) дисс. Тошкент.
8. Максетов, Қ. (1978). *Қарақалпақ фольклоры. III том. Қарақалпақ халық жумбақлары*. Некис: Қарақалпақстан.
9. Малов, С. (1930). К истории и критике Codex Cumanicus. *Изв. АН СССР. Отд. гуманитарных наук.*, 347-375.
10. Хусаинова, З. (1981). *Топишмоқлар / Ўзбек халқ ижоди*. Тошкент: Адабиёт ва санъат нашриёти.
11. АманжоловСерсен. Қазақ жумбақтары. Алматы. Ана тили. ЖШС.2003
12. Ибраимов К. Акматалиев А. Табышмактар. «Эл адабияты» сериясынын 14-тому. «Шам» басмасы, Бишкек 2002.
13. Prof. Dr. Şükrü ELÇİN. TÜRK BİLMECELERİ. Mas Matbaacılık – ANKARA © Kültür Bakanlığı, 1989
14. Nury Seyidow TÜRKMEN HALK MATALLARY AŞGABAT «MIRAS» 2005